

ORIGINAL



"Sharie Phillips-Swatek"
<massage@hawaii.rr.com>
10/01/2008 06:29 PM

To <clorenzo@dbedt.hawaii.gov>
cc
bcc
Subject Testimony luc Makakilo quarry.doc

Aloha Caroline,

This afternoon I was still getting emails with data, I am sorry this is sent at the 11th hour. I do hope that we keep the promise of Kapolei as a living and breathing community.

Thank you,
Sharie



Testimony luc Makakilo quarry.doc

LAND USE COMMISSION
STATE OF HAWAII
2008 OCT -2 A 7:23

Sharie Phillips Swatek
91-223 Hokuimo Place
Kapolei, HI 96707

September 30, 2008

Testimony to Land Use Commission regarding:

SP73-147 Pacific Concrete and Rock Co., Ltd. (Oahu)

To consider an amendment to the special use permit to (1) extend the life of the Makakilo Quarry resource extraction and aggregate processing operations to 2032; and (2) expand the resource extraction and buffer areas of the Makakilo Quarry located within the State Land Use Agricultural District at Puu Makakilo, Ewa, Oahu, Hawaii.

Dear Land Use Commission Members,

I oppose the requested amendment to the special use permit based on the research I will list below and my personal experience of the air quality in Kapolei.

When my husband and I bought our home in the Aeloa subdivision of the Villages of Kapolei in 1999 we were aware of the Makakilo Quarry extraction and aggregate processing operations and were informed that these operations would be temporary. During a chance conversation with a neighbor on August 17th I learned that Grace Pacific would likely receive a 24 year extension to operate the Makakilo Quarry and be granted the right to build a permanent asphalt plant in the quarry. This was shocking to me as until that moment I had no idea an asphalt plant was in our neighborhood.

My husband and I had signed the petition circulated by our VOK Association Board of Directors indicating our opposition to the 24 year extension and expansion of the Makakilo Quarry and fully expected our VOK Association Board of Directors to represent our interests to Grace Pacific and the State permitting process. When I learned that our VOK Association Board of Directors had changed their official position and was now supporting the Quarry extension I decided that I needed to get involved directly.

Discovery of lacking science

Grace Pacific claimed, and the VOK Association Board of Directors accepted, that the Makakilo Quarry operations, including the asphalt plant, were not a significant source of pollution. After numerous calls to the EPA, Clean Air Branch of Department of Health, Planning Commission, and other agencies this is what I discovered.

The EPA gives the charge of monitoring air quality to our Clean Air Branch of the State Health Department. The nearest monitoring station is about 4 miles away in Campbell Industrial Park. The EPA in San Francisco told me that Particulate Matter is the only

pollutant required to be measured for a hot-mix asphalt plant. However, there are 39 other toxins associated with asphalt plants, some known to the EPA to be Carcinogens, and I believe we should be testing for all of them.

Typical pollutants of Hot Mix Asphalt Plants;
(source: <http://www.cleanairstandards.org/article/2008/09/774>)

1. Criteria Pollutants:
 - Particulate Matter (PM-10)
 - Volatile Organic Compounds (VOCs)
 - Carbon Monoxide (CO)
 - Sulfur Dioxide (SO₂)
 - Nitrogen Oxides (NO_x)
2. Polycyclic Aromatic Hydrocarbons(PAHs) – semi-volatile HAPs
 - Naphthalene
 - 2-Methylnaphthalene
 - Acenaphthylene
 - Acenaphthene
 - Anthracene
 - Benzo(a)anthracene
 - Benzo(a)pyrene
 - Benzo(b)fluoranthene
 - Benzo(g,h,i)perylene
 - Benzo(k)fluoranthene
 - Chrysene
 - Dibenzo(a,h)anthracene
 - Fluoranthene
 - Fluorene
 - Indeno(1,2,3-cd)pyrene
 - Phenanthrene
 - Pyrene
3. Volatile Hazardous Air Pollutants (HAPs)
 - Acetaldehyde
 - Benzene
 - Ethylbenzene
 - Formaldehyde
 - Quinone
 - Toluene
 - Xylene
4. Metal HAPs
 - Arsenic
 - Beryllium
 - Cadmium
 - Chromium
 - Lead
 - Manganese
 - Mercury
 - Nickel
 - Selenium

The State Health Department visits the site once a year and for the rest of the year merely collects the reports given to them by Grace Pacific. Grace Pacific is on the honor system and measures from the golf course. The assurance that they are being monitored is misleading. While the EPA minimum standards of oversight may be met, I believe that

the entire toxic load to our city needs to be evaluated over time for the cumulative effects including all toxic loads from all sources. ***Where is the study that says this will be safe for an additional 24 years for those who have already been breathing Kapolei air for so many years and considers all other toxins already in the area?*** Unfortunately, the EPA is often reduced to an agency in the business of helping businesses get permits. We need complete testing due to the proximity of the new plant location.

Last week when speaking to Chris Steele at Grace Pacific he told me he thought his plant was as dangerous as one truck. If this is the case let's test for all of these toxins and make public the results and hopefully have an independent observer to the process, if not an independent testing source.

Stephen Lester is a consultant with the Center for Health and Environment Justice; he told me an asphalt plant that was this harmless would likely have the world at its door to find out how they accomplished this. He is unaware of one plant in the world that is this safe and he would like to know how it is accomplished. He is also happy to discuss with any of you the results from the testing of this plant. He can be reached at 703-237-2249. He has a Masters in Toxicology from Harvard.

Total load of toxins in the neighborhood are:

- Refinery
- Asphalt plant
- Quarry
- Agricultural land being farmed
- The digging of old agricultural land for new homes
- Pesticides sprayed at Kapolei Golf Course
- Wastewater Treatment
- Vog
- Traffic on H1 (I learned from Grace Pacific testimony that H-1 traffic is a very dangerous source of pollution.)

Even if we had exceptional monitoring we also have VOG now coming into Kapolei more frequently than we ever have before. So my question is: ***Where is the study that says what the cumulative risks are over time? And will they be independently evaluated? We have already lived about 8 years with the plant, how many more toxins can our bodies tolerate considering all other toxins in the neighborhood including VOG that is not controllable.***

During my three week crash course in what is going on in the neighborhood I heard the following from those who work in agencies, neighbors and the healthy.

Q: If people are really sick, where are they, and why do they not complain?

A: The most affected by an increased toxic load are children with parents too busy and overwhelmed to speak up, the infirm, elderly and those with autoimmune disease. The sickest and youngest cannot speak up for themselves and rely on government to speak up for them. The critical mass of education has yet to be reached, most neighbors do not

know what is going on, but once education begins and smoke stacks start blowing then they will notice and at that time many will be angry and feel betrayed. Being told to come to a meeting to discuss Grace Pacific after we were told our association would oppose it did not give anyone a sense of urgency. After they discover that other communities are protected by superior testing, they may wonder why their leaders did not take these steps.

Q: You have been living with the asphalt plant all these years; what is the problem with it continuing?

A: I tolerated the quarry with the understanding that it was coming to its end of life. But, so what; just because we suffered with toxins for 8 years should we have more? And what are the cumulative affects over time and who has studied this? I read recently that the VOG is on a 100 year cycle and this is uncontrollable and will be an uncontrollable influence on our air quality, can we afford more dust from the quarry and unmonitored toxins from the asphalt plant.

Q: Grace Pacific gives a lot of money to the community and people will lose jobs; you should be supportive.

A: That is great that they do that and I give them credit for giving to the community. However no amount of money should be traded for the health of children and adults. Show us you are safe, and make your tests public, hold them to the highest standards of any community and allow them to be scrutinized. Will jobs really be lost or just moved to another location?

Q: My kids have asthma because of the Vog.

A: If your kids have asthma they should not be exposed to other toxins, we know Vog is not the only issue, because mainland kids have asthma.

Q: H-1 is more toxic than the quarry and asphalt plant.

A: It is truly distressing that H 1 is dangerous to live around; even so, if this is the case why should we be exposed to additional toxins?

Q: I have to support this because people want more roads.

A: People want an answer to their problems. They want the city we were sold. Kapolei is supposed to be a place to work, play and live. While certain roads are needed, should it be at the expense of air quality? Why will it take 24 years to build these roads? What happened to a place we could live and work rather than commute out of for jobs?

Q: You may see a big pit but I see a mountain.

A: At first I thought this was Zen Koan. Then I realized it referred to the fact that when you drive down H-1 you do not see the pit, which is scheduled to increase in size. You have to be in neighborhoods to see the pit or drive through Kapolei. I do appreciate the fact an eye sore will not be seen, for most of the commuters. However, just because we do not see it does not mean it doesn't hurt quality of life. Can we put the same ingenuity to getting a very good test? You see a mountain, but residents smell an asphalt plant and get quarry dust.

Q: How much asthma is in Kapolei?

A: Asthma is only one condition, but 7.1% of adults and 12.8 % of children have this condition is Waipahu Ewa and Kapolei combined. No test have been done just for Kapolei. Among the Native Hawaiian population the percentage of asthma is 19.4% in children and 12.8% in adults the highest of any ethnic population. We have homelands in Kapolei. This study was provided to me today from Kishaba, Gregg S. [gregg.kishaba@doh.hawaii.gov]. Other sources show Hawaii as number one for asthma. (Source: <http://healthyamericans.org/state/index.php?StateID=H>)

Q: Just close your windows and turn on the air.

A: Unfortunately, I have had to do this for smells that make me dizzy for days at a time and impact my quality of life. I would rarely have to do this for hot weather. We get good breeze through our home and would rather live local style. My electric bill without air is greater than \$300. This is an unreasonable solution, and puts an unfair burden on those who believed in the vision of Kapolei and invested in the homes here.

Q: The wind does not blow in your neighborhood from lower Makikilo.

A: If I stand outside my home facing the mauka side, the breeze comes from Makakilo. Please stop telling me wind does not blow into my house from this direction, it is nonsense. Wind from the lower quarry blows through the Villages. *There has been no study on air quality in the Villages.* (Source: <http://www.hawaiiiss.com/weather/wx10.htm#>.)

Q: There are much worse polluters in your neighborhood.

A: This breaks my heart, and my lungs, and if it is true how can we can possibly tolerate more? No matter how clean, this could be the straw that breaks the camel's back. Please think of those who cannot speak for themselves.

Q: Just complain to the Air Quality Department or Grace Pacific.

A: I have called and others have too. Some people are told after filing complaints with Air Quality that their complaint is not credible because no one else called. Many times I have had overwhelming odors coming into our neighborhood, and I thought someone else would call.

Q: Grace Pacific will buy your home if you are too sick from their plant.

A: I did read this in our Villages newsletter. Have they ever done this or is this a promise they make to have us lower our objections. Because they believe they are safe, how does this work? Have they bought a house from someone?

Q: The smoke stacks are high enough to keep the pollution away from the community.

A: Given the pit is 200 feet deep, how can the smoke stack be high enough to blow over us? Will we see more smoke stacks? Our city has views of enough smoke stacks because of the refineries.

Personal experiences

I have smelled bad smells, had strange symptoms, and noticed I felt worse at home in the blue skies of Kapolei than I did on business trips to Kona in very thick VOG. The proposed new quarry site is 1.5 miles from my home.

I commuted between an apartment in Kona and Kailua, Oahu for several months in 1998 and 1999, I was newly married and my husband and I decided that it would be healthier to live on Oahu than the Big Island due to the Vog. During 1998 and 1999 I commuted from my home on the Big Island to Kailua, Oahu where my husband lived. Generally we felt Kailua was a healthy place to live and we loved it however he worked for the Bank of Hawaii and they encouraged their employees to consider living in the new city of Kapolei. We purchased a house here and I began commuting to Kapolei from the Big Island. During this time, I noticed a reversal, my energy level was now better on the Big Island and on the mainland than in Kapolei. For years I chalked this up to just an oddity but after I was made aware of the asphalt plant I no longer feel Kapolei lives up to its promise of a neighborhood to live, work, play and grow old. If the extension is granted it may be impossible for me to continue to live here. I have given you an overview but my health issues are extensive, and I thought I was moving to a healthy area. Twenty four years is a long time to have this operation so close to our home.

Mahalo for your consideration.

Sharie Phillips Swatek