

APPENDIX **A-4**

Other Correspondence



Ronald Sato

From: Trisha Kehaulani Watson <watson@honuaconsulting.com>
Sent: Friday, March 29, 2019 7:45 PM
To: Ronald Sato
Subject: Fwd: Hawaiian Memorial Park AIS = SHPD REVIEW
Attachments: 1-4-5-033_2018-02114_ARCHY_6E42_AIS Revision Attachment.pdf

Importance: High

Trisha Kehaulani Watson, JD, PhD
Owner and Senior Consultant

Honua Consulting
4348 Wai'ala'e Avenue #254
Honolulu, Hawai'i 96816

Tel: +1 808 392 1617
Fax: +1 888 392 4941

www.honuaconsulting.com
watson@honuaconsulting.com

Facebook /honuaconsulting
Twitter @honuaconsulting
YouTube /honuaconsulting

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: The contents of this email message and any attachments are intended solely for the addressee(s) and may contain confidential and/or privileged information and may be legally protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient of this message or their agent, or if this message has been addressed to you in error, please immediately alert the sender by reply email and then delete this message and any attachments. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any use, dissemination, copying, or storage of this message or its attachments is strictly prohibited.

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Lebo, Susan A" <susan.a.lebo@hawaii.gov>
Subject: **Hawaiian Memorial Park AIS = SHPD REVIEW**
Date: March 29, 2019 at 5:03:34 PM HST
To: Trisha Kehaulani Watson <watson@honuaconsulting.com>, Honua Consulting <admin@honuaconsulting.com>, rosannathurman <rosannathurman@gmail.com>

Hello,

Attached is SHPD revision request attachment for the following submittal:

Log No. 2018.02114

ATTACHMENT

Archaeological Inventory Survey for Hawaiian Memorial Park, Kāneʻohe Ahupuaʻa,
Koʻolaupoko District, Island of Oʻahu, TMK: [1] 4-5-033:001 (Thurman et al., August 2018).

Please make the requested revisions. Highlight the revisions in the report and provide a summary table indicating how/where the revisions were addressed.

In the interim, I'll work on preparing an acceptance letter.

Please let me know if you have any questions or concerns.

Sincerely,

Susan

Susan A. Lebo, PhD
Archaeology Branch Chief
State Historic Preservation Division
Department of Land and Natural Resources
Kakuhihewa Building, Suite 555
Kapolei, HI 96707
(808) 692-8019
Susan.A.Lebo@hawaii.gov

ATTACHMENT

Archaeological Inventory Survey for Hawaiian Memorial Park, Kāneʻohe Ahupuaʻa, Koʻolaupoko District, Island of Oʻahu, TMK: [1] 4-5-033:001 (Thurman et al., August 2018).

1. Replace temporary site #s with SIHP #s; provide a single table with temp/SIHP correlation.
2. Page 14. Indicate where GPS units were taken (center of trench; both ends; etc.) and accuracy of unit. Clarify – UTMS for boundary of site; within features – center? Reference Appendix C, Figure 205 and Table 14.
3. Provide full SIHP # first time introduced.
4. Provide SIHP #s for McAllister sites, where available and appropriate. Can be done in single paragraph or table and then you don't need to revise rest of report.
5. Page 39, example. No such thing as new sites. AIS documented one newly-identified site, Kawa Stream Bridge.
6. Page 42, Table 5. Fix formatting issues.
7. Page 54, Fig 24, Site #s should be SIHP #s.
8. Page 55, Fig 25, Site #s should be SIHP #s.
9. Page 56, Fig 26. Site #s should be SIHP #s.
10. Page 61. Site #s should be SIHP #s.
11. Page 62, Fig 27. Site #s should be SIHP #s.
12. Page 63. Remove extra period at end of quote.
13. Page 70, para 1. Clarify that map amendment was done during current AIS included GPS points.
14. Page 76, para 4. Criteria a-e refer to HAR 13-284-6, not HR or NR; HR and NR are Criteria A-D. Watts (1971) said significant for important person [Criterion B], workmanship and construction method [Criterion C]
15. Page 76, para 4. McCurdy and Hammatt (2009) recommended a 100-ft-wide buffer for heiau. Did SHPD concur?
16. Page 86. You are required to insert site integrity within each historic property description. Integrity = 7 aspects (location, material, feeling, workmanship, etc). Indicate which aspects of integrity are present and how they contribute to site significance (a-e). Do for all historic property descriptions.
17. Page 218. Significance is a-e, not A-E. Remove HR and NR. You are only doing 6E, HAR 13-284-6.
18. Page 218. Between Significance & Mitigation Recommendation, you need project effect determination. 11.1 Project Effect. "The AIS results support a HRS 6E-42 project effect determination of "Effect, with agreed upon mitigation commitments" pursuant to HAR 13-284-7(a)(2)." The project will have an adverse effect on one or more significant historic property and that effects will be potentially harmful. New 11.3 will be the mitigation.
19. Page 221-, Table 13. Delete and replace State and NR Eligibility with HAR 13-284-6 Significance (a-e); fix typos in this column. Criteria d and e. If you have Criterion e, you must have consulted regarding significance and proposed mitigation.

20. Page 221-. Insert section on your HAR 13-284 consultation required for sites significant per Criterion e. Your consultation MUST include OHA.
21. Page 221-, Table 13. Proposed Mitigation; revise and replace "Avoid and Protect" to preservation. These commitments must match HAR 13-284-8, A-E.
22. Page 244, Fig 204. Revise to convert Honua Site #s to SIHP #s.
23. Appendix C. Convert Honua Site #s to SIHP #s in figures.

Ronald Sato

From: Rosanna Thurman <rosannathurman@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, March 31, 2019 9:30 AM
To: Lebo, Susan A; DLNR.Intake.SHPD
Cc: Trisha Kehaulani Watson; Ronald Sato; Dodge Watson
Subject: Log No. 2018.02114 Revisions to HMP draft AIS
Attachments: HMP Draft AIS Edits from SHPD_3-30-2019.docx

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Completed



Aloha Susan,
Attached please find the revised draft AIS for the Hawaiian Memorial Park. Your requested revisions are highlighted in yellow in the report. Also attached is a table listing your requested revisions and our responses. We made all requested revisions and we hope the report is satisfactory.

Mahalo!

Rosanna Thurman
Principal Investigator
Honua Consulting and
Oceanic Archaeological Science
and Educational Services (OASES)
(808) 927-9920 cell

Table 1. Table Listing Edits for the Hawaiian Memorial Park (HMP) draft AIS

| Edit # | Section, Page # | SHPD Edit | Comment |
|--------|---|---|--|
| 1 | Throughout report, Table 7 pg. 61 | Replace temporary site #s with SIHP #s; provide a single table with temp/SIHP correlation. | Revisions were made throughout so that only SIHP numbers are listed in the Management Summary and Summary and Recommendations sections; where temporary Honua numbers are included they are placed after the SIHP number; in discussions of the sites the SIHP is used rather than the Honua number; Table 7 (pg. 61) was added to list temp/SIHP correlations |
| 2 | Section 2.1 Ped Survey, Pg. 14 | Indicate where GPS units were taken (center of trench; both ends; etc.) and accuracy of unit. Clarify – UTMS for boundary of site; within features – center? Reference Appendix C, Figure 205 and Table 14. | Highlighted sentence describing accuracy of GPS, added sentence referencing Appendix C, Figure 205, and Table 15 |
| 3 | Man. Summ, pg. ii; Section 1, pg. 1 | Provide full SIHP # first time introduced. | Added full site numbers for all sites within the Management Summary; In introduction added sentence “All sites documented within the project area are listed under State Inventory of Historic Places (SIHP) #50-80-10.” |
| 4 | Section 5.1, Table 5 on pg. 42 | Provide SIHP #s for McAllister sites, where available and appropriate. Can be done in single paragraph or table and then you don’t need to revise rest of report | McAllister 1933 was added to Table 5 which lists previous arch studies within and in vicinity, only one SIHP number has been given for nearby sites (SIHP # -354, Kawa’ewa’e Heiau) |
| 5 | Throughout report | Page 39, example. No such thing as new sites. AIS documented one newly-identified site, Kawa Stream Bridge. | Revised accordingly |
| 6 | Section 5.1 Prev. Arch., Table 5 on pg. 42-43 | Page 42, Table 5. Fix formatting issues. | Added descriptive headers and removed extra paragraph indentions |
| 7 | Section 7, Figure 24 on pg. 54 | Page 54, Fig 24, Site #s should be SIHP #s. | Updated the figure to include all SIHP numbers |
| 8 | Section 7, Figure 25 on pg. 55 | Page 55, Fig 25, Site #s should be SIHP #s. | Updated the figure to include all SIHP numbers |

| Edit # | Section, Page # | SHPD Edit | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------|---|---|
| 9 | Section 7, Figure 26 on pg. 56 | Page 56, Fig 26. Site #s should be SIHP #s. | Updated the figure to include all SIHP numbers |
| 10 | Section 8, on pg. 62 | Page 61. Site #s should be SIHP #s. | SIHP #'s are presented before Honua numbers |
| 11 | Section 8, Figure 27 on pg. 63 | Page 62, Fig 27. Site #s should be SIHP #s. | Updated the figure to include all SIHP numbers |
| 12 | Section 8.1.1 pg. 64 | Page 63. Remove extra period at end of quote. | Corrected the error and replaced with "..." |
| 13 | Section 8.1.1.2, pg. 71 | Page 70, para 1. Clarify that map amendment was done during current AIS included GPS points. | Revised to include the map was amended "during the current AIS"...recorded using GPS and tape and compass." |
| 14 | Section 8.1.1.2, pg. 77 | Page 76, para 4. Criteria a-e refer to HAR 13-284-6, not HR or NR; HR and NR are Criteria A-D. Watts (1971) said significant for important person [Criterion B], workmanship and construction method [Criterion C] | Revised to state that Watts (1971) recommended the site significant under Criterion D. However, in accordance with HAR 13-284-6 the current AIS found the heiau qualifies under all criteria (a-e). |
| 15 | Section 8.1.1.2, pg. 77 | Page 76, para 4. McCurdy and Hammatt (2009) recommended a 100-ft-wide buffer for heiau. Did SHPD concur? | Revised to state "the landowner established a 100-foot buffer around the site and works with local caretaker groups who assist with maintenance (McCurdy and Hammatt 2009)." |
| 16 | Section 11.3, Table 13 on pg. 219-222 | Page 86. You are required to insert site integrity within each historic property description. Integrity = 7 aspects (location, material, feeling, workmanship, etc). Indicate which aspects of integrity are present and how they contribute to site significance (a-e). Do for all historic property descriptions. | Included columns in Table 14 for Site Integrity and Significance |
| 17 | Section 11.1, pg. 218 | Page 218. Significance is a-e, not A-E. Remove HR and NR. You are only doing 6E, HAR 13-284-6 | Revised to "As outlined in HAR 13-284-6, a historic property must meet one of five broad categories to be significant (Criteria a-e)." Also changed A-E to a-e |
| 18 | Section 11.2, pg. 218 | Page 218. Between Significance & Mitigation Recommendation, you need project effect determination. 11.1 Project Effect. "The AIS results support a HRS 6E-42 project effect determination of "Effect, with agreed upon mitigation | Added Section 11.2 between the Significance Assessment and Mitigation Recommendation sections, using your provided language |

| Edit # | Section, Page # | SHPD Edit | Comment |
|--------|--|---|--|
| | | commitments” pursuant to HAR 13-284-7(a)(2).” The project will have an adverse effect on one or more significant historic property and that effects will be potentially harmful. New 11.3 will be the mitigation. | |
| 19 | Section 11.3, Table 13 on pgs. 219-222 | Page 221-, Table 13. Delete and replace State and NR Eligibility with HAR 13-284-6 Significance (a-e); fix typos in this column. Criteria d and e. If you have Criterion e, you must have consulted regarding significance and proposed mitigation. | Revised as requested, also added a symbol (*) in Table 13 with text at end of table describing sites recommended significant under Criterion e are subject to HAR 13-284-8(2) and OHA has been consulted |
| 20 | Section 3, pg. 18 | Page 221-. Insert section on your HAR 13-284 consultation required for sites significant per Criterion e. Your consultation MUST include OHA. | Added a paragraph to the Consultation section regarding consultation with OHA for sites deemed significant under Criterion e |
| 21 | Section 11.3, Table 13 on pg. 219-222 | Page 221-, Table 13. Proposed Mitigation; revise and replace “Avoid and Protect” to preservation. These commitments must match HAR 13-284-8, A-E. | Changed all instances of “Avoid and Protect” to “Preservation” |
| 22 | Section 11.3, Figure 204 on pg. 223 | Page 244, Fig 204. Revise to convert Honua Site #s to SIHP #s. | Updated the figure to include all SIHP numbers |
| 23 | Appendix C, Figure 205 on pg. C-1 | 23. Appendix C. Convert Honua Site #s to SIHP #s in figures. | Updated the figure to include all SIHP numbers |
| 24 | Section 9.5, pg. 215 | Add Curation Section | Added a section regarding the disposition of materials/curation |



Association of Hawaiian Civic Clubs
Founded 1959 Honolulu, Hawai'i

November 18, 2018

Aloha,

The Association of Hawaiian Civic Clubs has advocated the voices of the Native Hawaiian community since Prince Jonah Kuhio Kalaniana'ole founded the organization's movement in 1918. It is comprised of more than 60 clubs located throughout Hawai'i and the United States, and nearly 4,000 members.

The Association of Hawaiian Civic Clubs just adjourned its 59th Annual Convention in Kalapaki, Kaua'i, and about 400 participants convened to consider and deliberate on issues that affect the Native Hawaiian community like education, natural and cultural resource management, economic development, healthcare, housing, and government consultation. Through the course of the convention, the delegates from each club adopted 49 of resolutions that express positions on various issues, urge action, or honor the work of many who have contributed significantly to our community.

Enclosed you will find a resolution, or series of resolutions, adopted during our convention with the recommendation to notify you. We ask that you consider the content of the resolution.

Should you have further questions, please feel free to contact us:

The Association of Hawaiian Civic Clubs
P.O. Box 1135
Honolulu, HI 96807

Mahalo nui loa,

Annelie C. Amaral
President

acamaral@yahoo.com
www.aohcc.org

ASSOCIATION OF HAWAIIAN CIVIC CLUBS

A RESOLUTION

No. 2018 – 37

SUPPORTING ESTABLISHMENT OF THE KAWA‘EWA‘E HEIAU CULTURAL PRESERVE AS PART OF THE HAWAIIAN MEMORIAL PARK CEMETARY PLAN AND THE EXPANSION OF THE CEMETARY TO PROVIDE BURIALS SPACES FOR ISLAND FAMILIES

WHEREAS, Kawa‘ewa‘e Heiau is located on Kawa‘ewa‘e ridge in the ‘ili of the same name, in the ahupua‘a of Kāne‘ohe; and

WHEREAS, the heiau is believed to have been built by Chief Olopana as a Kū heiau centuries ago, and subsequently also used as an agricultural heiau dedicated to the god Lono; and

WHEREAS, during his visits to the Ko‘olaupoko moku, Chief Olopana stopped at Kawa‘ewa‘e Heiau to rest and to receive requests for help or judgment on various matters in the region; and

WHEREAS, the site is legendary as a wahi kapu where Olopana and Kamapua‘a met in conflict in ancient times; and

WHEREAS, after the great epidemics of the 19th century, when many of the people who cared for this heiau were stricken with fatal illnesses, there came a time where there was no one left to mālama this wahi kapu; and

WHEREAS, in addition, following the death of Kamehameha I and due to the influence of Ke Ali‘i Ka‘ahumanu, the people were forbidden to follow the teachings of the priests; and

WHEREAS, in modern times, with the emergence of western society in island communities, the heiau complex lands fell into other hands and were used for cattle grazing and other purposes; and

WHEREAS, nearby residents of the Pikoiloa tract re-discovered the heiau in the 1990s and began efforts to clear and raise awareness of its presence; and

WHEREAS, both the Ko‘olaupoko Hawaiian Civic Club and Queen Emma Hawaiian Civic Club have given of their service and time to mālama this wahi kapu over the years; and

WHEREAS, the property was acquired by Hawaiian Memorial Park Cemetery in 1983 as a potential area for development of burial spaces; and

WHEREAS, the landowners have subsequently decided that, as part of the cemetery's proposed expansion, a cultural preserve should be established to incorporate Kawa'ewa'e heiau complex; and

WHEREAS, the landowner has begun meetings with the Hawaiian Islands Land Trust and the Ko'olaupoko Hawaiian Civic Club to plan for establishment of the cultural preserve, including the setting aside of 100 Native Hawaiian burial spaces; and

WHEREAS, the entirety of the expansion area would be placed into a conservation easement managed by the Hawaiian Islands Land Trust to preserve the cultural and natural resources; and

WHEREAS, the entirety of the cultural preserve would be placed under the management of the Ko'olaupoko Hawaiian Civic Club for cultural and educational purposes that would benefit the club and surrounding community; and

WHEREAS, this cultural preserve would be included as part of the cemetery's plan to expand burial spaces available to the general public in the surrounding area; and

WHEREAS, this project becomes a model whereby private companies and Hawaiian Civic Clubs can work cooperatively to develop ways to give the management of lands and cultural resources to kūpuna, Hawaiian practitioners, and Hawaiian communities.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, by the Association of Hawaiian Civic Clubs at its 59th Annual Convention in Kalapaki, Kaua'i, in the malama of Welehu and the rising of 'Olepau, this 17th day of November 2018, supporting establishment of the Kawa'ewa'e Heiau cultural preserve as part of the Hawaiian Memorial Park Cemetery plan and the expansion of the cemetery to provide burials spaces for island families; and

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED, that a certified copy of this resolution is transmitted to the Governor of the State of Hawai'i, Mayor of the City and County of Honolulu, Honolulu City Council, the Ko'olaupoko Hawaiian Civic Club, and Hawaiian Memorial Park Cemetery, as well as the President of the State Senate, Speaker of the State House of Representatives, Chair of the State Senate Committee on Hawaiian Affairs, Chair of the State House Committee on Ocean, Marine Resources & Hawaiian Affairs, Chair of the Board of Trustees of the Office of Hawaiian Affairs, and all other County Mayors.



The undersigned hereby certifies that the foregoing Resolution was duly adopted in the malama of Welehu and the rising of 'Olepau on the 17th day of November 2018, at the 59th Annual Convention of the Association of Hawaiian Civic Clubs in Kalanaki, Kaua'i.


Annelle C. Amaral, President