MCCORRISTON MILLER MUKAI MACKINNON LLP

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

Randall F. sakumoto Attorney <u>Direct #s</u>: Phone - (808) 529-7304

TRANSMITTAL LETTER

VIA HAND-DELIVERY

To:	C&C of Honolulu,	Date:	June 2, 2015
	Dept. of Permitting and Planning Attn: Planning Commission/Gloria Takara	From:	Randail F. Sakumoto
	650 S. King Street, 7th Floor Honolulu, HI 96813	Re:	North Shore – State Special
	1101101111, 111 90015	Re.	Use Permit – 2014/SUP-6 (RY) Kawailoa Solar Farm

Copies	Date	Description
LAND USE COMMISSION STATE OF HAWAII 2015 JUN - 3 P 12: 24	4/15/15	Transcript – Volume II (Continu Public Hearing)

TRANSMITTED FOR:

- □ Your Information
- ☐ Your Signature and Return
- □ Your Signature and Forwarding as Noted Below
- Per Our Conversation

- □ Your Further Necessary Action
- □ Your Approval
- □ Your Review and Comment
- Per Your Request
- SEE REMARKS BELOW

IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE DO NOT HESITATE TO CALL.

REMARKS: Attach is the transcript with the original signed certification submitted from Ralph Rosenberg's office.

1	CITY AND COUNTY OF		
2	PLANNING COMMIS	NOTON	
3			
4	IN RE:	DEDUTE OALA (GUD C (DV	7)
5	NORTH SHORE-STATE SPECIAL USE	PERMIT-2014/SUP-6(R1	.,
6	KAWAILOA SOLAR FARM		
7			
8	VOLUME I		
9	CONTINUED PUBLI		
10	Taken in the Mission Memorial		
11	South King Street, Honolulu,		
12	1:33 p.m. on April 15, 2015.		
13			
14			
15	BEFORE: SHIRLEY L. KEYS,	RPR, CM, CSR 383	
16			
17		רודא ^מ נודא 15	120
18		LUN AND PE	
19		N -2 PERMI NTY 0	r
20		P	
21		P2:13	
22		e	
23			
24	4.		
25			

] (

(

			48
1		APPEARANCES:	
2			
3		Commissioners:	DEAN I. HAZAMA, Chair
4			KEN K. HAYASHIDA
5			CORD D. ANDERSON
6			DANIEL S.M. YOUNG
7			ARTHUR TOLENTINO
8			WILFRED A. CHANG
9	*		
10		Counsel for City an	d County of Honolulu
11		Planning Commission	:
12			JENNIFER WAIHEE-POLK, ESQ.
13			
14		For Applicant:	RANDALL F. SAKUMOTO, ESQ. and
15			MARGUERITE S. NOZAKI, ESQ.
16			McCorriston Miller Mukai
17			MacKinnon LLP
18			Five Waterfront Plaza
19			4th Floor
20			500 Ala Moana Boulevard
21			Honolulu, Hawaii 96813
22			
23			
24			
25			
		DALDI DOGENDEDG	CONDUCTION DEDODUCEDO INC
	2 		COURT REPORTERS, INC. HI (808) 524-2090
-	0 - 0 0		

Ć

[(

(

	49
1	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay. Good
2	afternoon. I call the meeting of the planning commission
3	to order, Wednesday, April 15, 2015. First item on the
4	agenda is approval of commission minutes, regular meeting
5	minutes for December 3. Is there any corrections or
6	comments?
7	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: Move to
8	approve.
9	COMMISSIONER HAYASHIDA: Second.
10	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Move to approve,
11	seconded. Any objections? Any abstentions? Seeing
12	none, the meeting minutes for December 3 have been
13	approved. Meeting minutes for March 4, 2015, any
14	corrections or comments?
15	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: Move to
16	approve.
17	COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Seconded.
18	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and
19	seconded for approval. Any objections? Any abstentions?
20	Okay. The meeting minutes for March 4 have been
21	approved. Regarding the meeting minutes for April 1, at
22	this time I'll call the department up.
23	MR. YOUNG: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
24	My name is Raymond Young. I just want to make a minor
25	correction with the I guess the confirmation of Wren,
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

	50
1	that's one of the wording that was looks like it's
2	out of context, so that's how I caught it. He said on
3	page 26 that so rather than create gates and gradings,
4	which is what the court reporter put down, I think he
5	meant gates and gratings, because it has to deal with
6	where animals cross.
7	MR. WESCOATT: Correct.
8	MR. YOUNG: Yeah. So it should be
9	gratings.
10	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay.
11	MR. YOUNG: And there was another page,
12	I'm not sure, and I checked with the speaker, which was
13	Bonnie at the time, on page 44, second line from the top,
14	there's a reference to an abbreviation ILSI. We don't
15	know what that is.
16	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: ILSI. What page?
17	MR. YOUNG: 44, second line from the
18	top. If we had the tapes, we would kind of figure out
19	what it meant, what she stated. Neither Bonnie or myself
20	could figure it out.
21	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: I think that's
22	probably IAL. Maybe that abbreviation should be IAL
23	instead of ILSI, so we'll make that addition.
24	MR. YOUNG: Okay.
25	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: So any other
	DALDU DOGENDERO COURE DEDORERO INC
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

[(

[(

. (

1	51 corrections or comments regarding the April 1 minutes?
2	Seeing none
3	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: Move to
4	approve.
5	COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Seconded.
6	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved for
7	approval and moved and seconded. Any objections? Any
8	abstentions? Okay. The meeting minutes for April 1 have
9	been approved. Moving on to the next item on our agenda,
10	it's a continuation of public hearing. Oh, okay. Going
11	back, I'm sorry, we have to backtrack, there are
12	executive session meeting minutes for March 4 and April 1
13	as well. Motion to approve those?
14	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: Motion to
14 15	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: Motion to approve.
15	approve.
15 16	approve. COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Second.
15 16 17	approve. COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Second. COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and
15 16 17 18	approve. COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Second. COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and seconded. Any objections? Any abstentions? Okay, the
15 16 17 18 19	approve. COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Second. COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and seconded. Any objections? Any abstentions? Okay, the executive session minutes for March 4 and April 1 have
15 16 17 18 19 20	approve. COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Second. COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and seconded. Any objections? Any abstentions? Okay, the executive session minutes for March 4 and April 1 have been approved. Thank you.
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	approve. COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Second. COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and seconded. Any objections? Any abstentions? Okay, the executive session minutes for March 4 and April 1 have been approved. Thank you. Moving on to public hearing
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	approve. COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Second. COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and seconded. Any objections? Any abstentions? Okay, the executive session minutes for March 4 and April 1 have been approved. Thank you. Moving on to public hearing continuation, North Shore - State Special Use Permit -
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	approve. COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Second. COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and seconded. Any objections? Any abstentions? Okay, the executive session minutes for March 4 and April 1 have been approved. Thank you. Moving on to public hearing continuation, North Shore - State Special Use Permit - 2014/SUP-6, Kawailoa Solar Farm, at this time I'd like to

Ĺ

[(

Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

1 at this time?

1

(

2	MR. YOUNG: My name is Raymond Young,
3	for the record. I'm a planner assigned the project.
4	With me is Bonnie Arakawa, my direct supervisor. We took
5	a look at the ag plan and we kind of had it quickly
б	reviewed, but we didn't have any objections. It wasn't
7	really something that our recommendation the
8	department's recommendation was asking for. We did have
9	it kind of cursory had it reviewed by staff over at
10	the Department of Ag, and we also kind of transmitted it
11	to the Office of Planning, but in general it kind of
12	we think it kind of meets the intent of what you guys
13	what the planning commission had recommended in extending
14	the hearing till today.
15	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay. Any other
16	clarifications or questions for the commission at this
17	time?
18	MR. YOUNG: No, we're open to comments
19	or questions if you have any.
20	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay.
21	Commissioners, any questions of the department at this
22	time? I just had one. In regards to director's
23	recommendation number one, the amount of time allowed
24	applicant between the operations of the solar company or
25	solar activity to the commencement of agricultural

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

1	53 operations is one year. Is there a specific reason why
2	it's a one year period versus any other time frame?
3	Either technology, technical kind of issues or
4	MR. YOUNG: No, it's somewhat
5	arbitrary. The specific reference is says applicant
6	shall be actively seeking to have such operations
7	established within one year of start of commercial power
8	generation, but there is a provision for extension. So
9	and it says extensions to this deadline may be granted by
10	the director of the DPP for unforeseen circumstances, so
11	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Right.
12	MR. YOUNG: I mean if you feel that
13	that's too long or too short, you know, it's your, you
14	know, prerogative to make a change to that.
15	MS. ARAKAWA: I think the director of
16	Planning and Permitting felt that that was a reasonable
17	time frame.
18	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: But it wasn't
19	because of any kind of technology or technical issue
20	regarding the operation of the solar facility.
21	MR. YOUNG: No, not at all.
22	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Just an arbitrary
23	statement. Okay. Commissioners, any other questions at
24	this time? Okay. Thank you.
25	MR. YOUNG: Thank you.
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.

](

Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

	54
1	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: At this time I
2	will call up the applicant and their agent.
3	MR. SAKUMOTO: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
4	commissioners. Randall Sakumoto and Marguerite Nozaki
5	for the petitioner, Kawailoa Solar, and Wren Wescoatt,
б	the development director.
7	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Good afternoon.
8	MR. SAKUMOTO: Good afternoon. We, as
9	you noted, did submit at the commission's request an ag
10	plan for the sheep grazing operation. It was also
11	requested, I think at the end of the meeting, that we
12	submit a backup plan in the event the sheep grazing
13	doesn't work or doesn't work to the extent that we hope
14	it will. So in that regard, we submitted a plan for
15	beekeeping, which was one of the other alternative ag
16	uses that we said we think would work on this property.
17	We submitted it on Monday. It was a
18	lot of information, a lot of work went into both reports.
19	I don't know whether the commission has had time to
20	digest all of that information. If the chair pleases,
21	I'm happy to try and provide a summary, if that would
22	help, of the two plans.
23	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay. Proceed.
24	MR. SAKUMOTO: Thank you. The sheep
25	grazing plan was put together with input from
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

0

(

Ć

55 representatives of Kualoa Ranch, as well as other local 1 ranchers who have experience in sheep grazing, as well as 2 managing large ranching operations of this scale, and 3 with us today is Daryl Kaneshiro, who flew in from Kauai. 4 He actually is running a sheep grazing operation on 5 Kauai, which is very similar to the one which we intend 6 to implement on the north shore. He's doing it in 7 connection with the KIUC, Kauai Island Utility Co-Op on 8 Kauai, so he's here as a resource. You know, we don't 9 pretend to be experts in this area, but we brought an . 10 expert with us in case the commission has specific 11 questions about the logistics of how this would work. 12 Just generally, what's in our materials 13 is that a reasonable estimate for the number of sheep to 14 pasture would likely fall within the range of 400 to 500 15 on the subject property. Initially, Kualoa Ranch 16 proposes to start with a flock of 200 sheep and then 17 expand from there as needed to an optimal level. As 18 noted in the last meeting, to insure that the grass is 19 not over grazed, the sheep rancher would utilize a 20 controlled grazing system, which involves a schedule for 21 rotating the herd from one paddock to another. 22 The total project site will be 23 separated into several pastures of varying sizes with 24 fixed or unmovable fencing of posts and hog wire or 25

similar construction. Within those pastures, the herd will be contained within smaller paddocks created by movable electrified fences. The total site would likely be divided into 30 paddocks of approximately twelve to 15 acres each, and the rotation would depend upon a number of factors, but generally it would take place once or twice a week.

In terms of water, we noted there sheep 8 generally consume about a half gallon to two gallons of 9 water per day while grazing. Some of that water 10 consumption would come through eating wet forage, some of 11 it would come through the use of water troughs, and you 12 know, we noted there that water troughs are movable 13 throughout the paddocks and can help distribute the sheep 14 to different parts of the paddock. That's all we have. 15 That's a summary of the sheep grazing. 16

In terms of the beekeeping, the plan 17 was put together by Dr. Steve Montgomery, who's a 18 renowned entomologist and has about 50 years of 19 experience in beekeeping, along with Mr. Yuki Uzuhashi, 20 who's the owner of Manoa Honey Company. Mr. Uzuhashi 21 currently farms over 200 colonies on Oahu. He's been a 22 beekeeper on a commercial scale since 2004, both in the 23 United States and in Japan. 24

25

In terms of the proposed operation if

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

57 we were to use beekeeping here, it turns out that this 1 property has a number of characteristics very favorable 2 to commercial bee hives. One, there's sufficient flat 3 land to place the hives in small clusters; two, the 4 access to the hives by vehicles is -- is something that 5 could be done because of the road system, so the vehicles 6 could transport the hives up and down the road, as well 7 as the products, the honey products and honeycomb created 8 These hives would be secured on this by the bee hives. 9 site from tampering by the public, and there's sufficient 10 natural vegetation in this area to provide bees with 11 access to pollen and nectar from flowering plants. 12 Approximately 20 hives would be moved 13 to the site initially, and as the beekeepers become more 14 familiar with the site and work out some logistics, it's 15 possible that they could have as many as 50 hives on this 16 property. A certain amount of maintenance is necessary 17 for the hives to insure that the bees remain healthy, and 18 it's estimated that a beekeeper would have to go up to 19 the site about once every two to four weeks. The bees 20 need nectar, pollen and water throughout the year, and 21 according to the experts, this property provides all of 22 those resources. So that's in a nutshell our two plans 23 that we submitted. 24

COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

1 Commissioners, any questions for applicant at this time? 2 Can I call upon Mr. Kaneshiro? He came all the way here 3 from Kauai.

58

Thank you, Mr. Planning MR. KANESHIRO: 4 Commissioner Chair, and I applaud the rest of the 5 commissioners for your volunteerism. I'm not sure if 6 most of you know, but I was -- I did serve politically 7 for over twelve years on the Kauai County Council, and 8 more recently -- and I retired in 2010, and I served as 9 the chair of the Board of Water Supply on Kauai. Now I 10 spend my full time on the ranch, and the concept has 11 worked for me. 12

Besides that, we run cattle, sheep, we 13 have the largest hog farm in the State of Hawaii. I 14 also, believe it or not, have a solar farm. It's not a 15 very large solar farm, it's one of the smallest, but we 16 were one of the first that started a solar farm in the 17 island of Kauai. And I have a 300kw that supplies all 18 the power to 192 homes. Again, it's not a very large 19 solar plant, there's other solar plants on the island, 20 only three that sign purchase power agreements with KIUC. 21 I happen to be one of them. I don't know if I had pull 22 or something or I was a former council member so they 23 allowed me to do one, but at the same time, there's one 24 on Kauai that was six megawatt, and there's another one 25

called Kapaa Solar that does own a 1.2 megawatt. 1 And the board got pretty smart, KIUC 2 They said you know what, I think we're going to board. 3 do our own, so they did. KIUC did their own solar plant, 4 it's a 12 megawatt solar plant located in Koloa. And so 5 they came out with an RPF to maintain the grounds. They 6 said, you know, we got to get somebody to maintain the 7 grounds because it's a great idea, instead of just 8 spreading it on the ground, that we can control the 9 erosion in some way, and grass is going to do that. 10 So I said -- my son, who's now a 11 council member, believe it or not, I don't know why he 12 did that, but he is, he was recently back, came up to me 13 and said dad, you know, we got to go and bid on this 14 project. And I said why? I'm retired. I'm really 15 And I have around 500 head of sheep on my 16 retired. ranch, and I have been out there on my own solar plant, 17 even though it's only a couple acres, weed eating, and 18 boy, let me tell you, at my age, it's damn hard work, and 19 we're talking really small acres. So I came up with this 20 great idea of putting sheep in there so I don't have to 21 22 weed eat too much anymore. I don't have to burn fossil fuel too much anymore. I don't have to worry about 23 cracking the glass or the PV panels. I said throw some 24 sheep in there and see how they do. They did well, 25

> RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

1 | believe it or not, they did really well.

Today we own a five year contract with 2 KIUC to maintain their 67 acre twelve megawatt solar 3 plant on the island of Kauai. There's another RFP coming 4 out very shortly for another owner, so the plant will be 5 built on Hawaiian Homes lands, and my son said maybe you 6 should try to bid on that. I said oh, man, give me a 7 break, you know, I'm really retired. But we've been 8 doing that, we've been doing it successfully on Kauai and 9 it's working. It's working real well. KIUC are very 10 pleased with what we're doing. 11

It was -- when we first got in, when we 12 were awarded the contract, as you know, KIUC just 13 basically opened SolarCity in September last year, they 14 opened a solar facility. We had gone in and it was 15 really hard work, let me tell you something, guys, I 16 hired people -- I hired guys to come out with machines, I 17 had people in there weeding eating, and you got to weed 18 eat with something special, you can't use those weed 19 eaters that go ba ba ba ba, and fly rocks all over the 20 place. You got 46,000 panels right there, so you've got 21 to go in with a special type of weed eater. It's tedious 22 work because now you start using hedge trimmers. Hedge 23 trimmers only can go certain way, you cannot go whacking 24 all over the place. So we did that. I had a lot of guys 25

> RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

1 quit on me. But, you know, that was a start. I had to 2 get the grounds to a point that I was satisfied and ready 3 to bring my sheep in. And now since then, I put in 250 4 head of sheep in there.

I did all the fences very similar to 5 what Mr. Sakumoto talked about, very similar way, I 6 rotate every week, and it's been really working for us. 7 And I have a proven record that it worked on my 300kw 8 solar plant. Even though it's a small one, we're still 9 doing it today, and I started that in 2012. So you know, 10 concept sometimes seemed pretty out of line, but in 11 reality, you know, I'm doing it. I'm doing it today, so 12 five year contract, we're hoping that maybe we can get 13 the other contract out in Anahola to also do the same 14 thing. So I'm open for questions. 15 COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Thank you. 16 Commissioners, any questions for Mr. Kaneshiro? 17 COMMISSIONER HAYASHIDA: Mr. Kaneshiro? 18 MR. KANESHIRO: Yes, sir. 19

20 COMMISSIONER HAYASHIDA: How many head 21 of sheep do you slaughter yearly or monthly?

MR. KANESHIRO: Do I --

23 COMMISSIONER HAYASHIDA: Slaughter or 24 bring to market?

22

25

MR. KANESHIRO: It varies. I am very

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

particular about my market because I'm -- we do 1 specialties, so my main market is Merriman's on the 2 island of Kauai. It's a high end market, but we also 3 sell a lot of sheep to the ethnic groups, where 4 individuals who buy sheep, or people that want to do the 5 same thing like I do, use the sheep for mowing. So, you б know, it varies, but reasonably with the plan, they can 7 move -- they can move pretty much sheep and really 8 stimulate the island of Oahu, because I have people that 9 fly over from Oahu to really come and buy sheep where we 10 take it to our local slaughterhouse, and of course the 11 ethnic group will come, pick a sheep out and bring it 12 back with them on barges. Can you imagine that? So I 13 believe there's a great market for it, because I don't 14 think there's any -- any sheep ranch here or sheep farm 15 in Oahu. 16 You know, I think the So it varies. 17 plan points out for about 20 to 30 possibly a week or 18

62

19 something like that or even -- so, you know, based on the 20 average per head sheep, it's good money for a farmer or 21 rancher. Plus, you know, he might charge these guys and 22 get paid to run the sheep in there, so that helps him, 23 you know, to continue doing ag.

24 And just as an example, I just saw part 25 of his plan, our A land, I didn't realize that, but

1	63 there's some nice A land designated areas here. Those
2	areas will be perfect to also keep their sheep or even
3	work your sheep, bring out the sheep from the solar plant
4	itself. You can have year round sheep at the solar
5	plant, but you got to put them someplace to work them.
6	You got to dock them, you got to castrate them, you got
7	to take out the ones that you know are ready for the
8	market. The A land there serves the purpose. It's the
9	perfect place to do something like that in an area like
10	that. So looking at looking at the area itself, you
11	know, just overall, that's a pretty cool place. I may
12	want to move my operation here to Honolulu.
13	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay, thank you.
14	Commissioners, any other questions at this time? Okay,
15	thank you very much.
16	MR. KANESHIRO: Thank you.
17	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: At this time I'll
18	call up any representatives from the Department of
19	Agriculture. Anybody from DOA?
20	MR. YAMAMOTO: We are prepared to
21	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: I won't ask you
22	for presentation, just reference for questions. Good
23	afternoon, Mr. Yamamoto.
24	MR. YAMAMOTO: Good afternoon. Earl
25	Yamamoto, Department of Agriculture.
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

0

0

] (

[(

Ć

COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Yes. The reason 1 I called you up is the applicant's package, the 2 Department of Agriculture submitted comments regarding 3 this project, this specific project regarding the solar 4 farm, and they had raised some concerns regarding the use 5 of this IAL land specifically. So can you kind of expand 6 a little bit or explain something a little bit more to 7 the commissioners what the department's concerns were 8 regarding the IAL? 9 This project, the MR. YAMAMOTO: Yes. 10 special use permit before you is the first special use 11 permit on important agriculture lands that are designated 12 by the Land Use Commission. Thus far, about -- there's 13 about 100 -- thank you, 101,000 acres statewide. And the 14 reason why we're concerned is as expressed in our letter 15 to DPP, the Department of Planning and Permitting, is 16 that while it's -- first, we would like -- we kind of 17 want to hold it to a higher standard than what is 18 currently the case with special use permits on regular 19 agricultural land, because important agricultural lands 20 are supposed to be receiving incentives for existing 21 agricultural uses. 22 It's representative of our -- or has 23 the capacity for more -- being more productive, so -- and 24

25 that's just a couple of the criteria used to identify

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

important agricultural lands, so we want to hold that to a higher standard. It's not a requirement in law, state law. It's just -- it's just something that we wanted to push forward, and I recommend in our one recommendation about insuring that the agricultural use of it be in existence for the duration of the operation of the solar energy facility. So that's where we're coming from.

COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay. Any 8 questions for Department of Ag? One of the issues that 9 the commission was wrestling with with regards to this 10 application was the fact that Act 55 basically controls 11 the use of renewable energy projects on ag land. Act 205 12 covers a little bit of the IALs as far as -- but there's 13 no real I guess time between the two in regards to -- as 14 far as 205 anyway, in regards to what conditions are in 15 regards to these projects on IAL land, so I mean what was 16 the intent of your department as far as Act 55 and 205? 17 MR. YAMAMOTO: You know, it was Act 55 18

19 we always -- we're always scratching around for things 20 that promote agricultural resources and activities, 21 because there's nobody speaking on behalf of it. One can 22 look at individual farmers, but a lot of them are too 23 busy, they don't necessarily speak English, so there's no 24 one speaking on behalf of the farming community or the 25 resources, of course, they're silent. It's agricultural

> RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

1 land and water.

25

So we -- and since we have no statutory 2 authority in agricultural land other than the lands that 3 are under our control, we need to be as -- I don't want 4 to use the word creative, but we search everywhere, so we 5 look at the purpose and intent of Act 55, which 6 emphasizes local food production as one of the 7 expectations. One of the -- the purpose of that bill 8 that allows for a special use permit for solar energy 9 facilities when they exceed the conditions expressed in 10 Chapter 205. 11

So with that in mind, then we -- and 12 that's how we develop our argument that we expect 13 something more. Again, there's no -- we checked 14 everywhere throughout 205, and a lot of the amendments in 15 205, Chapter 205 I'm speaking of, and the -- all the 16 legislation that has amended Chapter 205 with respect to 17 permissible uses on agricultural land, we looked at that. 18 We looked at the committee reports that the legislature 19 issues after every decision that they make, we're looking 20 for guidance and support for agricultural lands and 21 agricultural resources, and in this case we did just that 22 and came to the conclusion that we did in our letter to 23 the Department of Planning and Permitting. 24

With respect to your -- the question

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

1	67
1	about the land or maybe coincidence between important
2	agricultural land uses, permitted uses on IAL versus the
3	uses permitted on regular agricultural land, there is no
4	there's no boundary, there's no identified uses, or yeah,
5	no specific identified uses on important agricultural
6	lands that are any different from regular agricultural
7	land. Correct me if I'm wrong back there.
8	So that's it can become an issue
9	like in this particular case where one wonders why
10	like we pointed out again in our letter of why D
11	lesser quality lands, A, B, C, D and E, on D and E lands,
12	solar energy facilities are permitted without any further
13	state review, but on B rated lands, then we have a
14	special use permit requirement, so we emphasize the use
15	of D and E lands before considering B rated lands.
16	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: B and A.
17	MR. YAMAMOTO: Yes, and A.
18	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Any questions for
19	the department, Commissioners? I don't know what the
20	department's intending, but I know that Act 55 is
21	relatively new as far as enacted legislation, but if the
22	department and the State's intent is to hold the IAL
23	lands at a higher standard, then they need to go back to
24	the State's report on ag issues.
25	To be more specific, I mean as a
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.

Π

Π

[(

1	68 commission, we look at what we can look at as what the
2	law states, and we've been through situations where the
3	law's not specific or not clear, it's very ambiguous as
4	far as, you know, certain situations, and it doesn't
5	really help us out, especially when we are dealing with
6	projects that are kind of like the first time
7	experiencing this application. Okay. All right. Thank
8	you, sir. I appreciate it.
9	MR. YAMAMOTO: You're welcome.
10	COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Chair, I make a
11	motion to move to executive session.
12	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay. It's been
13	moved.
14	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: Seconded.
15	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and
16	seconded. Any objections? Any abstentions? Okay, at
17	this time the commission will move into executive session
18	to confer with corporation counsel on the duties, roles
19	and responsibilities of the planning commission. I ask
20	that the room be cleared at this time.
21	(Break from 2:04 p.m. to 2:15 p.m.)
22	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay. Thank you
23	for your patience. I call the meeting back into order.
24	COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Chair, I'd like
25	to make a motion. I'd like to make a motion to approve
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

69 the North Shore - State Special Use Permit - 2014/SUP-6, 1 Kawailoa Solar Farm, with the following conditions. If 2 at any time during the term of the SUP no compatible 3 agricultural operations exist on the usable lands of the 4 Petition Area for six months, the Applicant shall notify 5 the Commission and the Director of the DPP in writing 6 within 30 days of the end of the six-month period. The 7 Applicant shall attend a meeting of the Commission and 8 submit a report to the Commission detailing the 9 Applicant's actual and reasonable efforts to actively 10 seek the establishment of compatible agricultural 11 operations on the usable lands of the Petition Area. The 12 Commission shall determine whether probable cause exists 13 to reevaluate the SUP and to hold a hearing pursuant to 14 Section 2-49 of the Planning Commission Rules. 15 Extensions to the six-month deadline may be granted by 16 the Planning Commission for unforeseen extenuating 17 18 circumstances.

And I also make one additional revision so they align. Usable lands of the Petition Area, including areas under PV panels, shall be made available for compatible agricultural use at a lease rate that is at least 50 percent below the fair market rent for comparable properties, as long as the Project is in operation. Compatible agricultural operations shall be

70 established, or Applicant shall be actively seeking to 1 have such operations established, within six months of 2 the start of commercial power generation. Extensions to 3 this deadline may be granted by the Director of the DPP 4 for unforeseen extenuating circumstances. 5 COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Thank you. I 6 have a motion. Do we have a second? 7 COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Seconded. 8 COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Motion has been 9 seconded. Commissioners, we are in discussion. Any 10 discussions or comments? 11 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I just want to 12 make it clear that the second revision was just to make 13 them align appropriately, six months versus six to twelve 14 15 months. I have a COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: 16 question for the applicant. 17 COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Applicant, come 18 up, please. 19 COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: You've heard 20 the motion. And my question to the applicant, are you 21 okay with the two additions or recommendations with the 22 motion? 23 MR. SAKUMOTO: I think we're okay with 24 I'm not sure I heard all of the language, but from 25 it. RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

1	71 what I recall, it sounded okay. If maybe you could
2	reread the first one, that that would be very helpful.
3	Thank you.
4	COMMISSIONER HAYASHIDA: I think we're
5	really looking for like a good faith effort to establish
6	agricultural uses since this is important agricultural
7	lands.
8	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Are you almost
9	done evaluating?
10	MR. SAKUMOTO: I'm sorry. Yeah, if
11	maybe just one minute, or five minutes with my client to
12	just converse. The question that I think we're trying to
13	be sure we can tell you comfortably we're okay with is
14	I mentioned this like in the last time, that there are
15	periods of time where let's say one operation fails and
16	we need to bring in another one. So there's a transition
17	period to, you know, bring in a new farmer, a new
18	rancher. Whether that period is six months or longer
19	than six months, I want to be sure that I can tell you
20	it's where it is. I think obviously we would need to be
21	actively seeking another use during that time and not
22	just sitting back.
23	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: It's also
24	extendable, too.
25	MR. SAKUMOTO: Right.
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

(

0

1000

(

1	72 COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: The six month
2	period is extendable.
3	MR. SAKUMOTO: Right. So you know
4	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: You know, we'll
5	give you five minutes.
6	MR. SAKUMOTO: Okay. Thank you.
7	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Commissioners,
8	any objections to a five minute recess? Okay. We'll be
9	in recess for five minutes.
10	MR. SAKUMOTO: Thank you.
11	(Break from 2:20 p.m. to 2:25 p.m.)
12	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay, I call the
13	meeting back to order. Do you have any further comments?
14	MR. SAKUMOTO: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
15	Thank you for giving us time to confer. The only comment
16	we have here is in the second sentence, which says the
17	applicant shall attend a meeting of the commission and
18	submit a report to the commission, et cetera, I think if
19	you inserted the phrase if requested by the commission
20	the applicant shall attend a meeting, then that would
21	probably logistically make more sense. Otherwise, it
22	sounds like we'd have to send in the notice that we
23	didn't have the ag for six months and then attend the
24	meeting. I think if we sent a notice detailing the
25	explanation and if the explanation is unsatisfactory, the

[(

1	73 commission is free to request us to attend, and at your
2	request, we'll attend.
3	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Again, after the
4	MR. SAKUMOTO: So if before the phrase
5	the applicant shall attend, I think if you inserted the
6	phrase if requested by the commission.
7	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay. If
8	requested by the commission. Okay. Commissioners, any
9	questions for applicant? That's the only
10	MR. SAKUMOTO: That's the only
11	requested change. Thank you.
12	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Department, do
13	you have any comments?
14	MR. YOUNG: Thank you very much,
15	Mr. Chair. This is Raymond Young. Yes. We discussed
16	the proposed condition with our deputy and our
17	management, and we are concerned that this will this
18	project will extend for some what, 35 years, and of
19	course, we cannot anticipate what might happen, you know,
20	that long out. So if in the event that there are some
21	circumstances that this condition may want to be, you
22	know, modified and no longer applicable, is there a way
23	we can have the commission just at that point in time
24	where it's no longer applicable drop it without going
25	through the entire process of going through, you know

1

 $\left(\right)$

74 like what we do now. The rules, the way the rules read, 1 any time you want to modify a condition, you're going to 2 have to come back to the planning commission, you have to 3 have agency review, we got to send it out for comments 4 and all that. It's a long, drawn out process. 5 So if some point in the future this 6 condition is no longer applicable or it needs to be 7 modified, perhaps we could write it into the way the 8 condition is written that we can just have perhaps a 9 shorter way to do that without taking it through the 10 entire process. 11 COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Well, I guess --12 any questions? I had already pointed that in the 13 director's report, you state as one of your conditions 14 that if the project has any changes to it, they have to 15 So I am trying to -- I'm trying to understand come back. 16 is what situation this condition no longer applied in the 17 18 future. MR. YOUNG: Well, it's not something we 19 can anticipate at this point. Let's say you wanted to 20 change that time frame, for example. 21 22 COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay. Sure. MR. YOUNG: It's a minor change, but 23 we'll have to go through the entire process, for example. 24 COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Well, no, because 25 RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

	75
1	the condition states that the time frame is extendable.
2	MR. YOUNG: But if you wanted to change -
3	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: We couldn't
4	shorten it, we couldn't shorten it, that's true, we could
5	not shorten it to less than a six month period as the
6	condition is stated. We could extend it beyond six
7	months, but we couldn't shorten it to shorter than a six
8	month period. But I I'm assuming that that wouldn't
9	be necessarily practical for the applicant anyway.
10	MR. YOUNG: So the way the rules read,
11	any modifications to any of the conditions require it
12	come back through the whole process. So even if you
13	shorten it or extended it, the way the rules read, we'll
14	still have to go through the entire process, so it's a
15	big burden for all of us.
16	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: So I guess I'm
17	trying to just kind so if the condition says that the
18	time frame is extendable by the commission, you're saying
19	that if we extend that we decide in the future to
20	extend that time frame, that they would have to come back
21	through the process again?
22	MR. YOUNG: Yes, because you're setting
23	it at six months.
24	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: What would the
25	word reasonable do instead of six months? I'm just
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

Ũ

1

] (

(

	76
1	just a question.
2	MR. YOUNG: Rather than using a
3	specific time frame?
4	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: Rather than
5	having a six month.
б	MR. YOUNG: I think the condition is
7	partly covered under the annual reporting. So on
8	December 31 of each year, they would have to report to
9	the planning commission via the planning department,
10	their status on complying with the requirements for
11	establishing a compatible agriculture use, so at that
12	point when it comes in and we think that, you know, it's
13	not really addressing the intent, we could raise it with
14	the applicant, and if that's not satisfactory, we can
15	raise it with the planning commission, and that happens
16	every year.
17	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: Is that with
18	the word reasonable?
19	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: I guess my
20	problem with that is in regards to SUPs, the commission
21	I guess between the commission and the land use the
22	LUC, those are the agencies involved in SUPs. Correct me
23	if I'm wrong, but the director doesn't have the authority
24	to then reevaluate a SUP.
25	MR. YOUNG: That's correct, but
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

(

(

.....

(

1	77 COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: And my second
2	question is your condition number one, basically we're
3	revising it to six months, which is fine, but you have
4	one year. So along your train of thoughts go, if for
5	example, and it says extendable by the director for
6	extenuating circumstances as well, so likewise then, if
7	they exceed it here before they start the ag, would they
8	have to then come back again through the commission,
9	because it is a condition that the department wanted.
10	MR. YOUNG: Let me see that. So you're
11	suggesting perhaps we allow the director to be the agency
12	to allow the extension to the six months?
13	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: No, no. Your
14	previous statement was any time the time frame gets
15	extended or shortened, that would be considered a change
16	in condition that would have to then reappear before the
17	commission. But the director's report is condition one
18	as a twelve month time frame extendable by the director.
19	If he, for example, extends it beyond twelve months, or
20	has to for whatever reason, then does that also
21	constitute a change in the condition which would have to
22	MR. YOUNG: No, you're right, it
23	doesn't. It just puts the onus on the planning
24	commission to go through that process.
25	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: And I think one

(

of the reasons why we did that is because we're aware 1 that the director doesn't have purview of the SUP. So 2 hypothetical situation, I'm not talking about what --3 let's say the applicant comes for an IAL project and he 4 has a plan and he states that he's going to do 5 agricultural activity, he stops it after the first two 6 years and he never starts anything up again. Okay. Then 7 the commission, then we would like a way, because it's 8 IAL land, to be able to reevaluate that and somehow 9 insure that agricultural activities continue on this 10 property. That's just, I guess, giving us a mechanism to 11 be able to, if something happens, to be able to insure 12 that the applicant -- the applicant and future applicants 13 understand that because of the type of land that it's on, 14 IAL land, that we must maintain some kind of agricultural 15 component to the project. 16

Right. Perhaps if I could MR. YOUNG: 17 suggest instead of the -- it will try to address this 18 issue. Under the director's condition number six, we're 19 asking for a one year annual report to be submitted to 20 Perhaps that could be changed to six 21 the director. 22 months for the first maybe five years or something like that to be submitted to both the director and the 23 planning commission, rather than have something to that 24 Would that be a better compromise? Since we're extent. 25

> RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

	79
1	asking for an annual report anyway, we'll make it
2	semi-annual.
3	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay, but
4	MR. YOUNG: Rather than have something
5	like that, because what I'm trying to do is trying to
6	avoid having the planning commission do all that work,
7	you know.
8	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Well, I guess the
9	only the only condition that the planning commission
10	would have to get involved again is if the activity stops
11	and the applicant cannot produce to the commission's
12	satisfaction a reason why that cannot be extended or a
13	reason for stopping or ceasing agricultural activities on
14	the land. That would be the only time the commission
15	would get involved at the end.
16	You know, they could come if you're
17	worried about the time frame, it's extendable, so they
18	could submit a report to the commission saying, you know,
19	we had a problem with a farmer, and he no longer wants
20	operations, or we're actively seeking all these other
21	farmers to fill in, and the commission is satisfied with
22	that, then that's fine. We just read the report and go
23	forward.
24	What happened what happens though if
25	the applicant an applicant doesn't, you know, doesn't
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

i (

	80
1	make a reasonable effort to maintain the agricultural
2	component, so that's kind of like the crux of it.
3	MR. YOUNG: Understood.
4	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Of the condition.
5	So there's no with the applicant's insertion of
6	language, there's nothing that automatically retriggers
7	the hearing before the commission. The commission will
8	then, like I said, evaluate either the annual report and
9	the applicant's report, and then at that point they're
10	not satisfied, then the commission has the option to
11	reconvene another hearing. And obviously, I'm not going
12	to talk with the other commissioners, we also want to
13	avoid that. But we also want to send a message regarding
14	projects on IAL lands that is of the most importance,
15	that they must maintain agricultural component in order
16	to do the project.
17	Commissioners, any questions?
18	Department have anything else?
19	MR. YOUNG: No, not at this time.
20	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay. Thank you.
21	Well, first of all before I hear the motion, do you
22	have any objections to the applicant's revision?
23	COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: No.
24	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Okay. If you can
25	just restate the first part of the motion.
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

(

1	81 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Just restating
2	the first condition, if at any time during the term of
3	the SUP no compatible agricultural operations exist on
4	the usable lands of the Petition Area for six months, the
5	Applicant shall notify the Commission and the Director of
6	the DPP in writing within 30 days of the end of the
7	six-month period. If requested by the commission, the
8	Applicant shall attend a meeting of the Commission and
9	submit a report to the Commission detailing Applicant's
10	actual and reasonable efforts to actively seek the
11	establishment of compatible agricultural operations on
12	the usable lands of the Petition Area.
13	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Thank you. The
14	rest of it remains the same. Is there a second on the
15	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: I second it.
16	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and
17	seconded with the changes. Commissioners, any additional
18	discussion? Okay. Commissioners, all those in favor of
19	the motion on the floor say aye.
20	THE COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
21	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Any objections?
22	Any abstentions? Okay. The motion is passed. Thank you
23	very much. At this time, Commissioners, there are no
24	other items on the agenda. May we have a motion for
25	adjournment?
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS. INC.

[]

1

(

	82
1	COMMISSIONER TOLENTINO: Motion.
2	COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Seconded.
3	COMMISSIONER HAZAMA: Moved and
4	seconded. Any objections? Any abstentions? This
5	meeting is adjourned. Thank you very much.
6	(Meeting adjourned at 2:39 p.m.)
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
	RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090

(

(

CERTIFICATION I, SHIRLEY L. KEYS, Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of Hawaii, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the stenographic notes of the testimony taken by me in the above-captioned matter. 17.9 SR SHIRLEY L. KEYS, CSR #383 April 21, 2015 Dated: RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC. Honolulu, HI (808) 524-2090