MANCINI, WELCH & GEIGER LLP

JAMES W. GEIGER 4684-0 305 East Wakea Avenue, Suite 200 Kahului, Hawaii 96732 Telephone: (808) 871-8351 Facsimile: (808) 871-0732 Attorney for Petitioner BEFORE THE LAND USE COMMISSION D OF THE STATE OF HAWAI'I လှ In the Matter of the Petition) DOCKET NO. A12-795 of:) PETITIONER'S POSITION ON LAND WEST MAUI LAND COMPANY, INC., a) USE COMMISSION'S PROPOSED Hawaii corporation, and KAHOMA) FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS RESIDENTIAL LLC, a Hawaii) OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDER; limited liability company,) CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE To Amend the Land Use District Boundary of certain land situated at Lahaina, Island of Maui, State of Hawaii, consisting of 16.7 acres from the agricultural district to the urban district, Tax Map Key

PETITIONER'S POSITION ON LAND USE COMMISSION'S PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDER

Petitioner West Maui Land Company, Inc.

("Petitioner"), pursuant to H. Admin. R. § 15-15-82(c), supports the Land Use Commission's Proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, Decision and Order ("Proposed FOF/COL").

No. (2) 4-5-010:005.

A. Support of Proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, Decision and Order.

Petitioner supports the Land Use Commission's Proposed FOF/COL with two minor exceptions.

Findings of fact and conclusions of law must deal fully and properly with all issues to be decided in the matter under review, must make a reasoned decision, and must enable judicial review of that decision. Application of Hawaii Elec.

Light Co., Inc., 60 Haw. 625, 594 P.2d 612 (1979). Findings of fact must be clear, specific, non-conclusory and supportive of the ultimate statutory finding. Id. A finding of fact must leave none of the functions of the administrative agency to be discharged by others but must have all the sufficiency, fullness and perspicuity of a jury verdict. Burr v. Des Moines R.R. & Nav. Co., 68 U.S. 199 (1863).

A conclusion of law is a statement by which the administrative body analyzes facts under applicable common or statutory law. State v. Oaks, 163 N.C. App. 719, 594 S.E.2d 788 (2004).

In its review, the Commission must find upon a clear preponderance of the evidence that the proposed boundary amendment is reasonable, is not violative of H. Rev. Stat. § 205-2, and is consistent with the policies and criteria

established pursuant to H. Rev. Stat. §§ 205-16, 205-17, and 205A-2. H. Admin. R. § 15-15-77.

In the instant matter, the Proposed FOF/COL make a full and complete analysis of the decision making criteria for boundary amendments, make a reasoned decision, and enables the judicial review of that decision. As such, the Proposed FOF/COL served on the parties on March 29, 2013, should be approved with the following modifications.

First, there was an error with regarding to FOF 119.

The action meeting held by the Commission on January 10, 2013, occurred in Honolulu, Hawaii, and not in Kahului, Maui.

Accordingly, the location of the meeting referenced in FOF 119 should be changed to reflect its proper location.

Second, two typographical errors should be corrected.

In FOF 206, the word "Project=s" should be changed to

"Project's" and in FOF 216, the word "mile" should be changed to

"miles."

For the foregoing reasons, Petitioner respectfully requests that the Proposed FOF/COL be approved with the three requested changes identified above.

DATED: Kahului, Hawai'i, ____APR - 2 2013

JAMES W. GEIGER Attorney for Petitioner

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the date hereof I caused a copy of the foregoing to be duly served by depositing same in the United States mail, postage prepaid, to the following at their last known address:

Jesse K. Souki Director Office of Planning State of Hawaii 235 Beretania Street, 6th Floor Honolulu, HI 96813

David M. Loui, Esq.
Bryan C. Yee, Esq.
Department of the Attorney General
425 Queen Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

William Spence Director Department of Planning County of Maui 250 South High Street Wailuku, HI 96793

Patrick K. Wong, Esq.
James A. Giroux, Esq.
Department of Corporation Counsel
County of Maui
200 South High Street
Wailuku, HI 96793

Mr. Russell Tsuji
Administrator
Land Division
Department of Land and Natural Resources
State of Hawaii
P.O. Box 621
Honolulu, HI 96809

Michele Lincoln 452 Aki Street Lahaina, HI 96761

Routh Bolomet P.O. Box 37371 Honolulu, HI 96837

DATED: Kahului, Hawai'i, _____APR -2 2013

Attorney for Retitioner